

Bureaucratic Reform in Organizing and Managing Adaptive, Accountable, and Competency-Based Civil Servants Based on 'World-Class Smart Civil Servants'

Tauhid*¹, Muhammad Taufiq¹, Mas'ud¹, Haerun Yasin¹
¹Department of Public Administration, Universitas Mbojo Bima, Indonesia
**Email: tauhid.mbojo1969@gmail.com*

Article Info

Keyword:

State Civil Apparatus;
Bureaucratic Reform;
World-Class
Standards;
Descriptive
Qualitative;
Competency-Based
Civil Servants.

Abstract: The research focuses on enhancing the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) at the Human Resources Development Agency for the City of Bima, aiming to achieve world-class standards. The study addresses challenges, including low competence, limited innovation, inadequate IT and foreign language proficiency, and a constrained entrepreneurial mindset. Employing a descriptive qualitative approach, the research involves interviews with key informants such as the Regional Secretary, Government Assistant, Social Welfare representative, Head of BPSDM, and Head of the Competency Development Division. Additionally, observation and documentation methods were utilized to explore and resolve the research problems. The findings reveal that the current bureaucratic reform measures to develop the State Civil Apparatus into a world-class ASN have not been effective and have yet reached their full potential. Improvements in ASN achievements are essential within the framework of SMART ASN. Identified as the main obstacles to achieving world-class status by 2024 are the existing capacities of ASN, including professionalism, IT and foreign language proficiency, global awareness, and entrepreneurial spirit. In light of these findings, the study proposes implementing more stringent policies within the ASN community to yield more satisfactory outcomes in their journey toward becoming world-class innovative civil servants.

Article History:

Received: 22 March 2023
Revision: 01 May 2023
Accepted: 20 July 2023

This is an open access article under the [CC-BY-SA](#) license.



DOI: <https://doi.org/10.35326/jsip.v4i2.3429>

INTRODUCTION

The State Civil Apparatus, as skilled personnel, plays a vital role in forming an advanced and civilized modern society that obeys the law ([Wang et al., 2017](#)), is moral and democratic to provide the best service to the community/public fairly and reasonably without discrimination ([Garland, 2020](#); [Wei, 2021](#)). The State Civil Apparatus, or what is referred to as the State Civil Apparatus, must show a sense of national unity and maintain loyalty to Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution, which shows that the state civil machine is a servant of the state and society ([Rohayatin et al., 2018](#)).

The State Civil Apparatus consisting of civil servants and Government Employees with Employment Agreements (PPPK) must show their identity in a growing existence in the face of global changes based on information technology (IT) management ([Adawiyah & Devi, 2022](#); [Kurniawan et al., 2020](#)), increasing human resource competence, technology adaptation, and digitalization in the form of efficient, faster, more accurate, and more efficient public services.

Bureaucratic reform that continues to be repeated by the government to date is one of the efforts to carry out fundamental reforms and changes in the constitutional system in institutions, equipment, and personnel machines to realize a good and clean government ([Adawiyah & Devi, 2022](#); [Kurniawan et al., 2020](#)). That is, the success of bureaucratic reform itself must be supported by the competence of the State Civil Apparatus in carrying out its duties and responsibilities ([Biryanto et al., 2018](#)). Recognizing the importance of the quality of competence of The State Civil Apparatus to support this bureaucratic reform ([Vincent Simandjorang & Kurniawan, 2022](#)). Bureaucratic reform is an effort to organize, change and improve the governance of The State Civil Apparatus for the better and meet the demands of intelligent changes in the world-class State Civil Apparatus ([Rahmawaty et al., 2022](#)).

In supporting gradual, fast, and dynamic changes to applying the "Smart ASN" concept in providing quality public services. To facilitate such progress, the expertise of the State Civil Apparatus, especially from the millennial generation, is one of the keys to building a credible government ([Yogar et al., 2023](#)). The millennial generation, which is relatively "open," bright, and innovative, supported by the character of "Smart ASN," namely nationalism, integrity, global vision, communication, kindness, networking, and entrepreneurship, will bring changes in public services ([Faedlulloh et al., 2020](#)). In addition, the government's commitment to establishing cooperation and collaboration with all stakeholders is an effort to create innovation in management.

Smart ASN is where the country's civil machinery has world-class advanced and competitive capabilities in performing its duties. The implementation of Smart ASN brings optimism as a strategic step to accelerate the implementation of civil servants who are professional, honest, and serving to achieve world-class leadership and competitiveness in providing services to the community ([Cahyarini & Samsara, 2021](#)). In addition, implementing Smart ASN gradually, dynamically, and quickly will change

the quality of public services. Progressive ASN degrees and qualifications are one of the efforts to realize an open, efficient, and transparent bureaucracy as well as professionals. The competency development of civil servants in Indonesia is still a concern. It has obstacles, such as the absence of a clear action plan and annual planning, so competency development is not planned optimally ([Blesia et al., 2021](#)). This creates a further gap between competence and efficiency. Competence is a fundamental human characteristic that directly affects or can predict excellent performance. Qualifications are significant because qualifications mainly cover a person's basic work skills. Qualifications make it easier to perform the job to the required standard. Competency development is one of how learning tasks and programs aim to improve knowledge, skills, and abilities and the maturation of thinking through moral and behavioral change.

Therefore, the Smart ASN concept requires smart and innovative officials to build an intelligent bureaucracy with professionalism, nationalism, integrity, global vision, communication, friendliness, networking, and entrepreneurship. Bring changes to the provision of services ([Blesia et al., 2021](#)). In addition, the government's commitment to establishing cooperation and collaboration with all stakeholders is an effort to create innovation in management. So in Smart ASN, the demands of public services are also closely related to improving the quality of state civil apparatus resources with knowledge and professionalism. Of course, it is not easy to change the mindset of civil servants and reform the culture from previously having a service request mindset to civil servants who are aware of their existence as public servants. Therefore, through the ASN Law, it is expected to realize a state apparatus that is honest, professional, impartial, and free from political interference, corruption, conspiracy, and nepotism.

The number of Bima city government officials by 2022 by gender consists of 1,587 males and 1,927 females. So a total of 3515 people. Based on this information, most civil servants in Bima City Government are women from various Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD) ranging from Regional Secretariats, Agencies/Agencies, and Sub-Divisions to Complaints. When viewed from the ranks and groups of Civil Servants within the scope of the Bima city government, it can be detailed according to the table as follows:

Table 1. The State of Civil Servants According to Rank and Group in Bima City in 2021-2022

| No. | Pangkat/Golongan | 2021 | 2022 |
|-------|----------------------------|--------------|--------------|
| 1. | Pembina Utama / IV.e | 0 | 0 |
| 2. | Pembina Utama Madya / IV.d | 1 | 1 |
| 3. | Pembina Utama Muda / IV.c | 27 | 26 |
| 4. | Pembina Tk.I / IV.b | 231 | 226 |
| 5. | Pembina / IV.a | 532 | 488 |
| 6. | Penata Tt. I / III.d | 715 | 824 |
| 7. | Penata / III.c | 586 | 675 |
| 8. | Penata Muda Tk.I / III.b | 578 | 354 |
| 9. | Penata Muda / III.a | 491 | 560 |
| 10. | Pengatur Tk. I / II.d | 187 | 257 |
| 11. | Pengatur / II.c | 85 | 116 |
| 12. | Pengatur Muda Tk.I / II.b | 118 | 47 |
| 13. | Pengatur Muda / II.a | 12 | 11 |
| 14. | Juru Tk.I / Id. | 28 | 24 |
| 15. | Juru / I.c | 4 | 5 |
| 16. | Juru Muda Tk.I / I.b | 1 | 1 |
| Total | | 3.596 | 3.515 |

Source: BPS Bima City, 2023

However, it is undeniable that until now, the negative stigma of civil servants remains in the public's minds. The negative stigma of civil servants includes lazy civil servants, undisciplined, poor results and productivity, paid, difficult to fire, KKN, and complicated services. Hence, the assumption is that if it can be complex, why make it easier? And so on. This phenomenon shows that public confidence in the performance and productivity of civil servants is still low. This is the most fundamental problem that needs to be addressed immediately. To eliminate this negative stigma, Indonesian civil servants must continue to optimize their efficiency and productivity.

The author suggests that the concept of amanah and competent civil servants become values adopted and applied by Indonesian civil servants. If the concepts of Amanah and ASN Cerdas can be implemented, the negative stigma of ASN will automatically change along with the increase in efficiency and productivity of ASN. Based on the above problems, the author formulates the following problem: How is bureaucratic reform in managing the adaptive, accountable, and competency-based State Civil Apparatus with world-class "SMART ASN" at the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency? The study aims to describe and explain bureaucratic reforms in managing the State Civil Apparatus that are adaptive, accountable, and competently based on world-class "Smart ASN" at the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency.

The necessity of this study stems from a gap analysis of the existing situation of the Indonesian civil service system. Despite tremendous room for improvement, unfavorable stereotypes about government workers linger, and bureaucratic reform is urgently needed to address these concerns.

The author's notion of "Amanah" (trustworthiness) and "ASN Cerdas" (competent civil employees) presents a possible answer to the issues confronting the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in Indonesia. It is envisaged that applying these ideals would progressively change the negative stigma associated with ASN. Furthermore, the transition to a more adaptable, responsible, and competency-based system is anticipated to boost civil servant efficiency and production.

However, it is essential to go further into the practical issues of implementing these changes to attain these objectives. The study aims to describe and explain bureaucratic differences at the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency that will lead to the creation of Smart ASN - a world-class civil service model.

The observed vacuum in the existing research environment emphasizes the need to investigate the precise methods, policies, and procedures necessary to successfully restructure the State Civil Apparatus. By addressing this void, the study will add to the corpus of knowledge on public administration, human resource management, and bureaucratic reform in Indonesia and other countries confronting comparable issues.

By providing light on the practical procedures required to construct a competent, responsible, and adaptable civil service Smart ASN the study hopes to give significant insights to policymakers, administrators, and stakeholders engaged in civil service administration and development. Finally, this study will help to enhance public service delivery, governance, and the general growth of Indonesia's civil service system, serving as a model for beneficial reforms in civil service management across the globe.

RESEARCH METHOD

The type and approach of research used is a type of descriptive research intended that the problem to be studied is more scientific and accompanied by a systematic procedure using pretty convincing hills ([Kiernan & Hill, 2018](#)). The descriptive research aims to describe bureaucratic reform in managing the State Civil Apparatus that is adaptive, accountable, and competently based on world-class "SMART ASN" at the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency. The object of

this research is the Bima City Human Resources Development and Personnel Agency, located at Soekarno-Hatta Street, Bima City.

Data collection techniques are the most strategic step in research because the primary purpose of research is to obtain data. The researcher needs to know the data collection technique to get data that meets the set standards. Observation, interviews, questionnaires, and documentation can do data collection techniques ([Busetto et al., 2020](#)).

Data collection and information were carried out using data analysis carried out in this study using Data Analysis in the Field Model of Miles and Huberman ([Kalpokaite & Radivojevic, 2019](#)). Qualitative analysis activities are carried out interactively and occur continuously until they are complete and saturated. Qualitative data analysis activities are carried out interactively and occur continuously until complete and saturated ([Miles & Saldana, 2014](#)). Data analysis activities include reduction, display, and conclusion drawing/verification ([Mezmir, 2020](#)).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Various efforts of the central government in implementing bureaucratic reforms will compile and strengthen the competence of the world-class state civil apparatus until the end of the current government's mandate in 2024. Law No. 5 of the State Civil Apparatus of 2014 describes the political implementation and management of the State Civil Apparatus for bureaucratic improvement by the principles of professionalism, proportionality, accountability, efficiency, and effectiveness.

In its implementation, the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform launched a policy based on Smart ASN, expected to be achieved in 2024. This is the basis for improving the quality of public services, especially related to digital services. Industrial Age and Revolution 4.0. Smart ASN is a space where world-class, developed, and competitive civil servants perform their work with seven core competencies: integrity, nationalism, professionalism, global insight, information technology, mastery of foreign languages, and spirit. Friendliness, spirit. Entrepreneurship ([Cahyarini & Samsara, 2021](#)).

The research focus is bureaucratic reform in managing the State Civil Apparatus that is adaptive, accountable, and competently based on world-class Smart ASN at the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency, as follows:

Apparatus Must Have Integrity

The ASN is part of the Indonesian HR personnel development system, so an understanding of the status and role of civil servants is needed ([Jumady & Lilla, 2021](#)). In every regional apparatus organization, civil servants' positions and roles are decisive because civil servants are the most critical administrative management factors related to public services, influence, community protection, guidance, and control or direction and guidance ([Kuziemski & Misuraca, 2020](#)). Operations related to bureaucratic and public interests. Thus, civil servants must follow and practice

professional behavior, be honest and fair, always keep promises, be firm and disciplined, love their profession, and have noble morals.

To produce the ASN, awareness of the integrity of the ASN is needed. In implementing ASN Integrity, the model built by the Bima City Civil Service Development Agency prioritizes employee work ethic. Any behavior and actions of staff morale officers in resuscitation or non-resuscitation should be based on personal rules. According to the State Service Law Number 5 of 2014 (UU ASN), the duty of the State Civil Apparatus is to carry out public services, state duties, and specific development tasks; it is necessary to build a State Civil Apparatus that is honest, professional, impartial and free from political interference, free from corruption, conspiracy and nepotism and able to provide public services to the community and able to act as a glue for the unity of the nation Pancasila and the Constitution State of the Republic of Indonesia in 1945.

According to the Minister of Environment and Forestry, the integrity of millennial civil servants is typical of professional people who have seven principles of public life, namely selflessness, honesty, objectivity, accountability, openness, honesty, and leadership skills, not thinking about oneself means prioritizing common interests and not acting for material benefits for themselves alone, family or group. However, integrity is not bound by ties outside the position in the form of financial ties or other obligations that may affect the fulfillment of their duties.

The results of an interview with Regional Secretary, Bima City that the importance of honesty for civil servants is one of the most critical/main qualities that must be possessed by a servant of the state and society, namely consistency in actions, ways, values, principles, greatness. Standards, expectations, and various issues arise, mainly to promptly accelerate the implementation of public duties and services. Furthermore, an honest person means an honest person and strong character ([Labolo & Indrayani, 2019](#)). With a principled attitude that firmly maintains principles, does not want corruption, and becomes a foundation associated with him as values and moral traits, characteristics, or conditions that show complete unity so that they have potential and abilities that radiate. Authority and integrity.

Apparatus Must Have a Spirit of Nationalism

Every civil servant must have the spirit of nationalism and the ability to train the spirit of nationalism in carrying out their duties and responsibilities. Every civil servant who has a strong sense of nationalism must think to prioritize the interests of the public, the nation, and the state ([Shand et al., 2022](#)). ASN officials no longer think sectorally with their intellectual bloc but always put the nation's interests and the more significant state first. Values that always lead to the public interest (society) are core values that every civil servant must own.

The results of an interview with the Head of BPSDM Bima City said that every civil servant must live the values embedded in the whole person, which is related to love for the homeland and nation as implementers of Pancasila values. The same thing

was conveyed, stating that the side of nationalism developed: 1. Love the motherland, 2. Willing to sacrifice, 3. Unity and unity, and 4. Never give up.

Therefore, the government aims to encourage the national spirit of civil servants as representatives of good citizens to break through the harmonization of regulations in advancing civil servants, improving service standards and evaluation because the work carried out by the government is progressing ([Hermanto, 2023](#)). Very good, which encourages managers of government agencies to actively participate in the procurement process to determine strategic positions in their environment and periodically evaluate the suitability of the proper HR position in a position.

Apparatus Must Be Professional

Professional civil servants play a crucial role in public service, ensuring "feel good service" for both the community and civil servants ([Einstein & Glick, 2017](#)). Professionalism involves balancing bureaucratic capabilities with task requirements, ensuring an organization's expertise and ability to reflect its goals. A civil servant must be professional, responsible, and competent in various authorized fields to provide services effectively. This balance is essential for forming a professional institution and a sense of direction and goals.

Professional civil servants are essential in public service, providing a "feel good" service for both the community and civil servants themselves. Professionalism is crucial for forming a professional institution, as it requires expertise and the ability of its apparatus to reflect the organization's direction and goals ([Rojikinnor, 2020](#)). A civil servant must be professional, responsible, and competent in various fields duly authorized by their respective sections. Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning the State Civil Apparatus states that to implement the nation's ideals and realize the state's goals, it is necessary to build a state civil apparatus that is integrity, professional, neutral, free from political intervention, clean from corrupt practices, collusion, and nepotism.

Civil servants must possess competence in technical, managerial, and socio-cultural competence. Technical competence is measured by education, functional technical training, and work experience, while managerial competence is measured by education, structural or management training, and leadership experience. Socio-cultural competence is measured by work experience in plural societies, allowing for national insight.

Professional civil servants are crucial in public service, providing a positive experience for both the community and civil servants themselves. Professionalism is essential for forming a professional institution, as it requires expertise and the ability of its apparatus to reflect the organization's direction and goals. Civil servants must be professional, responsible, and competent in various fields authorized by their respective sections. Law Number 5 of 2014 requires a state civil apparatus that is integrity, professional, neutral, free from political intervention, clean from corrupt practices, and free from nepotism. Technical, managerial, and socio-cultural

competence are essential for civil servants, with technical competence measured by education, functional technical training, and work experience.

Apparatus must be Global Insightful

Developing civil servants with a global perspective is crucial for the ASN to realize the President's vision of an advanced Indonesia that is sovereign, independent, and personable. ASN should have an adaptive mindset, support flexibility, innovation, and visionary leadership competencies ([Vincent Simandjorang & Kurniawan, 2022](#)). They should collaborate with strategic stakeholders to address national and regional issues and improve agency performance by setting the right vision or policy direction. Additionally, ASN should be globally minded and proficient in using IT devices.

An interview with the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency's Head of Human Resources Development and Performance Assessment revealed that civil servants need global insight to build a whole government, avoid sector egos, regional egos, and institutional egos, and improve service quality. Smart ASNs possess global insight, master technology, information, language, and high networking skills. The World Government Effectiveness Index assesses public service provision, bureaucratic quality, civil servant competence, independence against political pressure, and government commitment to policies.

Bureaucracy as a system that manages government administration with sound governance principles, high professionalism, competence, transparency, and accountability ([Arwanto & Anggraini, 2022](#)). The bureaucrats' work ethic depends on the bureaucratic system's maturity, resulting in efficient and effective functioning. The Bima City, Human Resources Development Agency, faces challenges in achieving the world-class Smart ASN 2024. The agency should be open to technological and information developments, provide qualifications and competitions for human resources, and have a vision and mission for future civil servants within the Smart ASN framework.

Apparatus Must Master IT and Foreign Languages

Establishing relationships with other agencies and organizations is crucial for the state apparatus to provide the best service for the community ([Anshari & Hamdan, 2022](#)). Civil servants must embrace and utilize information technology, such as cloud computing and extensive data management, which are part of the industrial revolution 4.0. Mastery of office applications like Word, Excel, and Powerpoint is no longer an added value but should be controlled by each state apparatus. The Head of BPSDM Bima City stated that an ASN must understand and master English and IT to face world-class civil servants in 2024. This prepares them for the development of competence and professionalism in the State Civil Apparatus, and mastering English language skills is essential in responding to civil servants' development towards world-class standards.

ASN in Bima City Government, particularly the Bima City Human Resources Empowerment Agency, is only a tiny part of the workforce prepared to face world-class civil servants. The Ministry of State expects ASN to master IT and foreign languages, Gaptik (Stuttering Technology), and information skills. This includes operating and utilizing its products like the internet to improve performance and efficiency. Mastery of IT/digital is also essential for civil servants in the digital revolution era ([Karman et al., 2021](#)), as e-government technology enables more accessible access to government policies and smoother government programs.

Apparatus Must have Hospitality

The ASN must be friendly, promoting ethical and profitable attitudes and behaviors. Most OPDs in Bima City Government have an Employee Code of Ethics, per Bima Mayor Decree Number 26 of 2017. The regulation outlines five ethical rules: state, organizational, social, self-ethics, and colleagues. Civil servants must possess innovative and informative abilities to handle administrative and development tasks, improve public services, and provide information to the public. The concept of hospitality extends beyond hospitality, encompassing the entire language used to describe hospitality. By adhering to these ethical guidelines, civil servants can contribute to the overall success of the city government.

Hospitality is an advanced art and science focusing on respectful and humane service to the community. Businesses need to provide sincere service, helping them fulfill their true humanity ([Anshari & Hamdan, 2022](#)). The Bima City Government should implement hospitality to manifest the value of knowledge, attitudes, ethics, and service skills. The State Civil Apparatus should provide friendly and friendly services to service recipients, ensuring the public feels comfortable and valued as a whole human soul. ASN, a public servant, is known for kindness and hospitality, showcasing a friendly and attractive nature in language, speech, and attitude in every task, particularly in providing excellent service to the community.

Apparatus Must have an entrepreneurial spirit

The ASN must possess an entrepreneurial spirit that includes courage, creativity, innovation, and responsibility in seizing and creating opportunities. This spirit is crucial for many people's future and for bringing society prosperity. ASN must be productive, innovative, and responsible in seizing and creating opportunities while focusing on community welfare and helping those in need ([Sharif & Arif, 2021](#)).

The head of Competency Development of the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency emphasized the importance of having an entrepreneurial mindset in Bima City. He emphasized the need for ASN employees to have a mindset similar to entrepreneurs, who often want to avoid losing their minds. As a bureaucratic machine, ASN must work hard and contribute clear and measurable performance to their organizations. However, many civil servants still need to gain the necessary skills and knowledge to contribute to their organizations effectively.

The Bima City Government has issued Regulation Number 25 of 2021 to support entrepreneurs for civil servants. The evaluation of the Regional Medium-Term Development Planning Document and Regional Apparatus Strategic Plan Document reveals that organizational units need a business process map to implement programs and activities efficiently and effectively. The Business Process Map aims to create value-added outputs for stakeholders by illustrating effective working relationships between organizational units and achieving organizational objectives.

Furthermore, in Article 3, it is affirmed that the preparation of the Business Process Map aims to make each Regional Apparatus/Work Unit:

1. able to carry out tasks and functions effectively and efficiently;
2. easy to communicate to internal and external parties about the business processes carried out to achieve the vision and mission of the Regional Government, as well as to achieve the objectives of the Regional Apparatus/Work Unit;
3. Have knowledge assets that integrate and document in detail the business processes carried out to achieve the vision and mission of the Regional Government, as well as to achieve the objectives of the Regional Apparatus/Work Unit.

Thus, the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency is an institution that oversees and fosters the State Civil Apparatus within the scope of the Bima City Government by supporting each. The ASN to plan the development stage, the implementation stage, and the monitoring and evaluation stage of the Business Process Map by referring to the regional level business process map, and the responsibility lies with the Head of the respective Regional Apparatus Organization ([Agnes & Wijaya, 2021](#)).

CONCLUSION

The research highlights the significance of instilling an entrepreneurial spirit within the ASN to promote productivity, innovation, and responsibility. The entrepreneurial mindset, comprising courage, creativity, innovation, and the ability to seize opportunities, is crucial for many individuals' future and society's prosperity. This approach emphasizes the importance of ASN employees working diligently and contributing measurable performance to their organizations while prioritizing community welfare and supporting those in need.

The Head of Competency Development at the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency emphasizes the need for ASN employees to embrace an entrepreneurial mindset similar to entrepreneurs who seek to avoid stagnation. Despite being part of a bureaucratic machine, ASN must strive to gain the necessary skills and knowledge to contribute to their organizations effectively. To support this goal, the Bima City Government has issued Regulation Number 25 of 2021, which aims to foster entrepreneurship among civil servants.

One of the essential tools in this endeavor is the Business Process Map, as revealed in the evaluation of the Regional Medium-Term Development Planning Document and Regional Apparatus Strategic Plan Document. This map facilitates the efficient and effective implementation of programs and activities, creating value-added outputs for stakeholders while ensuring effective working relationships between organizational units to achieve their objectives. Preparing the Business Process Map empowers Regional Apparatus/Work Units to carry out their tasks effectively and efficiently, enabling seamless communication with internal and external stakeholders about their processes. Additionally, the map serves as a knowledge asset, documenting in detail the business processes necessary to fulfill the vision and mission of the Regional Government and achieve the objectives of the Regional Apparatus/Work Units.

The Bima City Human Resources Development Agency oversees and fosters the State Civil Apparatus within the Bima City Government. By supporting Regional Apparatus Organizations in developing, implementing, and evaluating their Business Process Maps, the agency promotes a bureaucratic reform that nurtures adaptive, accountable, and competency-based civil servants, ultimately aspiring to create "World-Class Smart Civil Servants." This approach strives to transform the mindset and culture of civil servants, embracing entrepreneurship and elevating the quality of public services for the betterment of society.

REFERENCE

- Adawiyah, P. R., & Devi, M. A. S. (2022). Reducing the Risk of State Civil Apparatus Indiscipline Violations During Pandemic Using the SiPERLU Application in Lumajang. *International Conference on Public ...*, 209(5), 512–519.
- Agnes, A., & Wijaya, A. F. (2021). Information System Strategic Planning Using Ward and Peppard Framework At the Regional Secretariat of Bengkayang Regency, the Organization Section. *Sebatik*, 25(1), 131–137. <https://doi.org/10.46984/sebatik.v25i1.1283>
- Anshari, M., & Hamdan, M. (2022). Enhancing e-government with a digital twin for innovation management. *Journal of Science and Technology Policy Management*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSTPM-11-2021-0176>
- Arwanto, A., & Anggraini, W. (2022). Good Governance, International Organization and Policy Transfer: A Case of Indonesian Bureaucratic Reform Policy. *JKAP (Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Administrasi Publik)*, 26(1), 33. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jkap.68703>
- Biryanto, B., Hubeis, A. V., Matindas, K., & Sarma, M. (2018). The Influence of Communication Skills towards Job Performance of The State Civil Apparatus. *Jurnal Studi Pemerintahan*, 9(3), 393–419. <https://doi.org/10.18196/jgp.9386>
- Blesia, J. U., Iek, M., Ratang, W., & Hutajulu, H. (2021). Developing an Entrepreneurship Model to Increase Students' Entrepreneurial Skills: an Action Research Project in a Higher Education Institution in Indonesia. *Systemic Practice and Action Research*, 34(1), 53–70. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11213-019-09506-8>
- Busetto, L., Wick, W., & Gumbinger, C. (2020). How to use and assess qualitative research methods. *Neurological Research and Practice*, 2(1), 1–10.

- <https://doi.org/10.1186/s42466-020-00059-z>
- Cahyarini, B. R., & Samsara, L. (2021). The Challenges of Digital Competency Implementation Towards World-Class Bureaucracy. *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 17(2), 259–274. <https://doi.org/10.24258/jba.v17i2.825>
- Einstein, K. L., & Glick, D. M. (2017). Does Race Affect Access to Government Services? An Experiment Exploring Street-Level Bureaucrats and Access to Public Housing. *American Journal of Political Science*, 61(1), 100–116. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajps.12252>
- Faedlulloh, D., Maarif, S., Meutia, I. F., & Yulianti, D. (2020). Birokrasi dan Revolusi Industri 4.0: Mencegah Smart ASN menjadi Mitos dalam Agenda Reformasi Birokrasi Indonesia. *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 16(3), 313–336. <https://doi.org/10.24258/jba.v16i3.736>
- Garland, D. (2020). Penal controls and social controls: Toward a theory of American penal exceptionalism. *Punishment and Society*, 22(3), 321–352. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1462474519881992>
- Hermanto, B. (2023). Deliberate legislative reforms to improve the legislation quality in developing countries: case of Indonesia. *Theory and Practice of Legislation*, 11(1), 1–31. <https://doi.org/10.1080/20508840.2022.2080392>
- Jumady, E., & Lilla, L. (2021). Antecedent and Consequence the Human Resources Management Factors on Civil Servant Performance. *Golden Ratio of Human Resource Management*, 1(2), 104–116. <https://doi.org/10.52970/grhrm.v1i2.101>
- Kalpokaite, N., & Radivojevic, I. (2019). Demystifying qualitative data analysis for novice qualitative researchers. *Qualitative Report*, 24(13), 44–57. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2019.4120>
- Karman, K., Deswanto, R., & Ningsih, S. A. (2021). Implementasi E-Government Pada Pemerintah Daerah. *Jurnal Studi Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 2(2), 43–50. <https://doi.org/10.35326/jsip.v2i2.1525>
- Kiernan, M. D., & Hill, M. (2018). Framework analysis: a whole paradigm approach. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 18(3), 248–261. <https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-D-17-00008>
- Kurniawan, R., Djaenuri, A., Prabowo, H., & Lukman, S. (2020). Analysis of Policy Evaluation and Model of ASN Management Improvement in terms of Planning, Recruitment, and Competency Development Aspects. *International Journal of Science and Society*, 2(4), 404–418. <https://doi.org/10.54783/ijssoc.v2i4.226>
- Kuziemski, M., & Misuraca, G. (2020). AI governance in the public sector: Three tales from the frontiers of automated decision-making in democratic settings. *Telecommunications Policy*, 44(6). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.telpol.2020.101976>
- Labolo, M., & Indrayani, E. (2019). Bureaucratic Reform and The Challenge of Good Governance Implementation in Indonesia. *International Journal of Kybernology*, 3(2), 25–42. <https://doi.org/10.33701/ijok.v3i2.591>
- Mezmir, E. A. (2020). Qualitative Data Analysis: An Overview of Data Reduction, Data Display and Interpretation. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*, 10(21), 15–27. <https://doi.org/10.7176/rhss/10-21-02>
- Miles, H., & Saldana. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis. A Method Sourcesbook* (Edition 3). SAGE Publications.
- Rahmawaty, C., Putri, D. M., Lawelai, H., Nastia, N., & Sadat, A. (2022). Sub-District

- Government Bureaucracy and Public Services Performance During the COVID-19. In *Journal of Social Politics and Governance (JSPG)* (Vol. 4, Issue 1, pp. 54–66). <https://doi.org/10.24076/jspg.2022v4i1.864>
- Rohayatin, T., Warsito, T., Pribadi, U., Nurmandi, A., Kumorotmo, W., & -, S. (2018). Faktor Penyebab Belum Optimalnya Kualitas Penyelenggaraan Pelayanan Publik Dalam Birokrasi Pemerintahan. *Jurnal Caraka Prabhu*, 1(01), 22–36. <https://doi.org/10.36859/jcp.v1i01.50>
- Rojikinnor, R. (2020). Organizational commitment and professionalism of State Civil Apparatus to determine public satisfaction through good governance, public service quality and public empowerment. *Journal of Social and Economic Development*, 22(2), 401–413. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40847-020-00105-1>
- Shand, R., Parker, S., Liddle, J., Spolander, G., Warwick, L., & Ainsworth, S. (2022). After the applause: understanding public management and public service ethos in the fight against Covid - 19. *Public Management Review*, 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2022.2026690>
- Sharif, Z. F., & Arif, K. F. (2021). The role of entrepreneurial orientation in achieving organizational prosperity: An analytical study of a sample of administrative leaders in private universities in the Kurdistan region. *Review of International Geographical Education*, 11(10), 1516–1538.
- Vincent Simandjorang, B. M. T., & Kurniawan, A. (2022). Contextual Bureaucratic Reform in the Recruitment System of the State Civil Apparatus of Indonesia. *KnE Social Sciences*, 599–617. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v7i9.10967>
- Wang, W., Li, H., & Cooper, T. L. (2017). Civic Engagement and Citizenship Development: The Case of Homeowners' Participation in Neighborhood Affairs in Beijing. *Administration and Society*, 49(6), 827–851. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0095399715581041>
- Wei, L. (2021). The Ability to Build Social Governance in China. *General Theory of Social Governance in China*, 393–414. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-5715-3_11
- Yogar, B. N. A., Mutiarin, D., & Eko Saputro, M. N. C. (2023). Jogja Smart Service as a Digital Public Services: Based on Agile Governance Perspective. *INFOTECH: Jurnal Informatika & Teknologi*, 4(1), 105–113. <https://doi.org/10.37373/infotech.v4i1.562>